24 JUNE 2009

11 DCCE2009/0935/F - ALTERATIONS TO DWELLING TO INCLUDE A TWO-STOREY EXTENSION AND ATTACHED GARAGE AT 175 AYLESTONE HILL, HEREFORD, HEREFORDSHIRE, HR1 1JJ

For: Mr. D. Quine per Mr. P.S. Hackett, Dunhampton Cottage, Hatfield, Leominster, Herefordshire, HR6 OSE

Date Received: 5 May 2009Ward: AylestoneGrid Ref: 52360, 41751Expiry Date: 30 June 2009Local Members: Councillors NL Vaughan and DB Wilcox

1. Site Description and Proposal

- 1.1 No. 175 Aylestone Hill is a two-storey detached dwelling with two small lean-to to the rear and a detached single garage situated on the western side of A465 (known as Aylestone Hill) on the north eastern fringes of Hereford City. Immediately north is a detached bungalow (No. 177a) with a further detached dwelling (No. 173) to the south. The site falls within the designated Aylestone Hill Conservation Area.
- 1.2 Planning permission was granted last year (DCCE2008/1168/F) for the demolition of the existing rear additions and the detached garage and the construction of a two storey rear extension and a new garage. Also proposed was the construction of a porch to the front elevation of the property, but given its size, planning permission was not required. This application seeks planning permission for an amendment of the previously approved scheme. The amendment being:
 - a) Change of the roof design of the two storey element from a single gable to two smaller gables;
 - b) Change of the openings arrangement and windows design at ground floor and first floor of the proposed extension; and
 - c) Change of the external facing materials of the proposed extension to timber boarding instead of the rendered finish.

2. Policies

- 2.1 Herefordshire Unitary Development Plan 2007:
 - H18 Alterations and extensions
 - HBA6 New development within conservation areas

3. Planning History

3.1 DCCE2008/1168/F - Two storey and single storey extensions. Approved 23 June 2008.

- 3.2 DCCE2005/0248/F Two storey extension to provde double garage and study with two bedrooms over. Pitched roof over existing kitchen. Appeal dismissed 10 October 2005.
- 3.3 DCCE2004/2489/F Single storey and two storey extension, new pitched roof over exiting extension. Application withdrawn 4 October 2004.

4. Consultation Summary

Statutory Consultations

4.1 None required.

Internal Council Advice

- 4.2 Traffic Manager: No objections.
- 4.3 Conservation Manager: The proposal would be acceptable as they would have a minimal impact on the character of the conservation area. Timber boarding buildings can be found in the area and given that it would not impact upon the vistas from Aylestone Hill the proposal would be acceptable. Boarding, slates, rainwater goods and joinery details are subject to approval.

5. Representations

- 5.1 Hereford City Council: No objection.
- 5.2 One letter of objection has been received from Mr. J.R. and Mrs. M.O. Jenkins, 177a Aylestone Hill, Hereford. The main points raised are:
 - The new design is overal approximately an increase of 40% in volume above the eaves line. Also having the two gable ends instead of the previous single gable and a higher guttering line than the previous design. All this together will have a massive negative visual impact on our property.
 - The proposed new rear windows would overlook directly into our property. The large diamond shaped windows, although set at an apparently higher level are, in our opinion, an unattractive addition to the appearance of the property as they appear over-sized and are not in keeping with the original house design. We would appreciate that these windows were reduced in size by being cut down to the top half of the diamond shapes resulting in triangular windows.
 - The plan shows the finish as stained wooden boarding which we feel is neither in keeping with the original building nor the surrounding properties.
- 5.3 The full text of these letters can be inspected at Central Planning Services, Garrick House, Widemarsh Street, Hereford and prior to the Sub-Committee meeting.

6. Officer's Appraisal

6.1 It is noted that the principle for the construction of a two-storey extension to the rear of the property has already been established by the extant planning permission. Therefore, the main issue for the consideration of this application is whether the amendment would have

unacceptable impact on the visual and residential amenity in relation to the property itself and the neighbouring properties.

- 6.2 The proposal mainly relates to the modification of the roof design and the external appearance of the proposed extension and does not involve the change of the overall footprint of the approved extension. From a design point of view, the alteration to the roof design from a larger single gable into two smaller gables is acceptable in this instance. The reduction of the roof volume and the lower ridgeline would minimise its bulky appearance and allow the extension to be visually subservient to the main property. The use of the timber boarding finish for the new extension is, in this instance, also acceptable. The proposed extension is located to the rear of the property and as such this extension would not be readily visible from public vantage points. In this context, it is not considered that the extension would appear incongruous or out of keeping with the character of the dwelling. In addition, the extension would not impact upon the vistas from Aylestone Hill and therefore it will have minimal impact on the character and appearance of the Conservation Area.
- 6.3 With regard to residential amenity, the proximity of the proposed extension and the window openings to the rear has caused some concern but the existing relationship between the property and the neighbouring bungalow (No. 177a) is such that there is already overlooking of the neighbour's garden. The introduction of an additional opening at first floor to the rear will mean that the proposed extension may have a further impact on the amenity of the neighbour's property. However, a sectional plan has been submitted showing that the position of the new windows will be placed 1.7m above the normal eye-level. In this context, it is considered the height is sufficient to ensure that the overlooking impact is not so significant. A condition is recommended should permission be approved to restrict new first floor openings to be placed in the rear elevation so as to safeguard the neighbour's amenity. Furthermore, the proposed extension is located in an acute angle to the southeast at a distance of more than 9 metres to the neighbour's living room window. A flat roofed garage is also found in between the proposed extension and the neighbour's bungalow. In this context, it is not considered that the extension would dominate the view of their living room window result in any unacceptable overbearing impact.
- 6.4 In summary, the concerns of the objectors are acknowledged but it is considered that the effect on privacy and amenity would not be significant and sufficient to warrant refusal in this instance. On balance, the proposal in this revised form would not prove detrimental to the residential amenity of the neighbouring properties or the visual amenity of the locality and the conservation area. The proposal is considered acceptable in accordance with relevant planning policies and therefore the amendment is acceptable.

RECOMMENDATION

That planning permission be granted subject to the following conditions:

1. A01 (Time limit for commencement (full permission)).

Reason: Required to be imposed by Section 91 of the Town and Country Planning Act 1990.

2. C01 (Samples of external materials).

Reason: To ensure that the materials harmonise with the surroundings so as to ensure that the development complies with the requirements of Policy DR1 of Herefordshire Unitary Development Plan.

3. F07 (Domestic use only of garage).

Reason: To ensure that the garage is used only for the purposes ancillary to the dwelling and to comply with Policy H18 of Herefordshire Unitary Development Plan.

4. F16 (No new windows in specified elevation).

Reason: In order to protect the residential amenity of adjacent properties and to comply with Policy H18 of Herefordshire Unitary Development Plan.

Informatives:

- 1. N03 Adjoining property rights.
- 2. N15 Reason(s) for the Grant of PP/LBC/CAC.
- 3. N19 Avoidance of doubt Approved Plans.

Decision:
Notes:

Background Papers

Internal departmental consultation replies.

24 JUNE 2009

